

BOARD OF ETHICS

John D. Marshall, Jr., Chair Kenyatta Mitchell, Vice-Chair MaryAnne F. Gaunt Susan Housen Lawrence S. Levin John Lewis, Jr. Jacquee Minor 68 MITCHELL STREET SW, SUITE 3180 ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0312 (404) 330-6286 FAX: (404) 658-7720

ETHICS OFFICE Ginny Looney, Ethics Officer

Ethics Office Investigative Report



Case Number: CO-06-024
City Arborist – Falsification of Documents

Claudia Janka Investigation Manager July 6, 2006



CITY OF ATLANTA

BOARD OF ETHICS
John D. Marshall, Jr., Chair
Kenyatta Mitchell, Vice-Chair
Susan Housen
Leah Janus
Lawrence S. Levin
John Lewis, Jr.
Jacquee Minor

68 MITCHELL STREET SW, SUITE 3180 ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-0312 (404) 330-6286 FAX: (404) 658-7720

ETHICS OFFICE
Ginny Looney
City Ethics Officer
glooney@atlantaga.gov

July 6, 2006

Steven Cover Commissioner Department of Planning & Community Development 55 Trinity Avenue, SW Atlanta, GA 30303

Dear Commissioner Cover:

In response to your memorandum dated June 16, 2006, the Ethics Office has conducted an investigation into allegations that Stanley Domengeaux, a city arborist, falsified his work logs to boost his productivity numbers. The investigation showed that Mr. Domengeaux made entries into his work log of addresses that did not exist, properties on which no trees grow, and addresses for which no request for service was made.

While there is no evidence that Mr. Domengueaux violated the City's Code of Ethics, it appears he did engage in misconduct that is serious enough to warrant disciplinary action. Attached is a copy of the investigative report prepared by Claudia Janka, the investigation manager for the Ethics and Audit Offices.

The report recommends that the department take appropriate disciplinary action against Mr. Domengeaux based on the facts presented. I would appreciate a report within 30 days on the action that the department takes in this matter.

The report does not make any recommendations about the department's policies and procedures because the changes that the department is making to its data collection system should resolve many of the underlying conflicts and problems related to the Arborist Division.

If you or your staff would like to discuss this report or its recommendations, please let me know.

Sincerely.

Ginny Looney

cc: Jackye Fauntlerov

Ainsley Caldwell (w/o report exhibits)

Stanley Domengeaux

Tom Coffin (w/o report exhibits)

Claudia Janka

INVESTIGATIVE REPORT ETHICS OFFICE CASE CO-06-024

Summary

The Ethics Office's investigation revealed that Stanley Domengeaux falsified documents while working as an arborist. He reported in his field notebook as well as his daily log in File Maker Pro that he conducted tree evaluations that could not have been done because the addresses do not exist or no trees grow on the property. Although there is no evidence that Mr. Domengeaux violated the Code of Ethics, he did engage in serious misconduct for which disciplinary action is warranted. Therefore, it is recommended that the Department of Planning and Community Development take appropriate disciplinary action against Mr. Domengeaux.

<u>Overview</u>

Date: July 6, 2006

Case: CO-06-024

Employee under investigation: Stanley Domengeaux, Arborist

Complainant: Tom Coffin, Arborist

Allegation: Falsification of documents

Witnesses: Tom Coffin, Arborist

Ainsley Caldwell, Arboricultural Manager

Stanley Domengeaux, Arborist

Investigator: Claudia Janka

Narrative Report

On 5/26/06 I met with the complainant, Tom Coffin, Arborist. Mr. Coffin came to my office with documents alleging that Stanley Domengeaux was falsifying documents to elevate his productivity.

Mr. Coffin had printed out documents from File Maker Pro that showed addresses where Mr. Domengeaux had allegedly conducted tree evaluations. There was no request for service at these locations. There are four ways to request service for a tree evaluation: in person, email, phone in or coworker. A request for service will have a contact name and phone number and the addresses pulled by Mr. Coffin did not have that information; therefore, there would be no name or address to send the proper permit to.

Mr. Coffin had permission to select ten locations that Mr. Domengeaux had listed in File Maker Pro and go to these locations to verify that they were good addresses. Mr. Coffin had this information documented and checked each location to find that they did not exist. In addition, these locations had no request for service.

On 5/31/06 I contacted Mr. Caldwell who advised me that he had begun his own investigation on Mr. Domengeaux. Mr. Caldwell was going to look at Mr. Domengeaux's field notebook and verify the addresses that he had listed.

On 6/8/06 I contacted Mr. Caldwell who stated that he had asked for Mr. Domengeaux's field notebook and asked Mr. Domengeaux to accompany him to three locations. Mr. Domengeaux told Mr. Caldwell that he did not want to go because some locations may not exist. Mr. Caldwell asked him to elaborate and Mr. Domengeaux refused, only saying that he felt pressured to increase his numbers.

On 6/16/2006, Commissioner Steven R. Cover forwarded the department's findings of discrepancies in Mr. Domengeaux's daily log book, daily reports in the File Maker Pro database, and reported versus actual on-site visits.

On 6/22/06 I met with Mr. Caldwell to ride along with him to verify his findings. The addresses are listed below:

- 2062 Bethel St., NW. does not exist, but there is a Bethel Dr., NW. The numerical sequence is by 8. I saw no 2062 Bethel Dr., NW, and there were no duplexes or apartments that would justify that number according to the City of Atlanta plat map. The address is non-existent, as well as there were no dead trees in the purported area. The minimum required frontage to build a structure is fifty feet. Every plat on Bethel Dr., NW ranges from fifty feet to eighty feet; therefore, a new lot would not meet the requirements. Photos were taken at this location.
- 725 Felker Ward St., NW. The addresses at this location commence at 1937 and end at 2437. Felker Ward is a dead-end street traveling east and stops at Hollywood Rd. traveling west.

• 1235 Margaret PI., NW. The numerical sequence on Margaret PI. commences at 941 and end at 1072. Numerical sequences at this location are in increments of six. With a minimum of fifty feet of frontage for each lot, it would be impossible to have a house number of 1235. That would be over sixteen lots in a space that could conceivably have six to eight lots between Margaret PI., NW and Eugenia Rd.; therefore, this address does not exist.

On 6/28/06 I went to five other locations that Mr. Domengeaux had documented in his field notebook to see if these locations were valid. I visited the following locations:

- 1892 Defoors Ave., NW. I did not locate this address. There are town homes at this location and individual house numbers for each town home. The numbers range from 1600 to 1200 Defoors Ave., NW. I took one photo at this location.
- <u>2321 Northside Dr., NW</u>. I observed Bobby Jones golf course at this location. The golf course extends for several blocks and there are no houses on the golf course. I took a photo at this location.
- <u>2582 Habersham Rd., NW</u>. I located 2570, 2586 and 2592. These are single family homes and I found no 2582.
- 213 Blackland Rd., NW. I located 205 and adjacent to that was 225. I took photos at this location. I located no 213.
- 1231 Howell Mill Rd., NW. There is a strip mall on that side of the street with numbers that range from 1181 to 1207. Adjacent to the mall is the City of Atlanta Water treatment facility. This area is secured with barb wire along the fence and locked gates. I observed no trees inside this facility only water, buildings and concrete. This could conceivably be 1231; however, there are no trees to evaluate at this location

On 7/5/06 Mr. Domengeaux came to meet me in my office. I asked Mr. Domengeaux to explain about the non-existing sites that I had visited. Mr. Domengeaux avoided the question and began to tell me how Tom Coffin harasses him and places pressure on the other employees to produce higher numbers. It is my understanding that Mr. Domengeaux and Mr. Coffin have had an ongoing dispute, which may have led to this current complaint. Once again I asked Mr. Domengeaux about his field notebook and the non-existing addresses. Mr. Domengeaux was silent for approximately one minute, and then said, "I did what I did and I will accept the consequences."

Conclusion

My investigation revealed that Mr. Domengeaux did falsify documents to elevate his productivity. In addition, Mr. Caldwell stated that Mr. Domengeaux's productivity has decreased since the investigation began. Because Mr. Domengeaux's work logs are official city records and his actions in creating false entries appear to be intentional, Mr. Domengeaux has engaged in serious misconduct for which disciplinary action should be imposed. See City Code Sec. 114-528 (20).

I recommend that the Department of Planning and Community Development take appropriate disciplinary action against Mr. Domengeaux based on the facts presented. Among the factors to consider are the severity of the offense, the deliberate nature of his actions, his work performance, and prior disciplinary actions against him, if any.

Supporting Documents

- 1. Photos of Defoor Ave. NW, Northside Dr. NW, Blackland Rd. NW, Bethel St. NW, Felker Ward St. NW, Margaret Pl., NW.
- 2. Memo to Ainsley Caldwell from Tom Coffin.
- 3. Memo with list of tree evaluations with no request for service.
- 4. Photographic copies of map locations that Mr. Caldwell and this investigator visited.
- 5. Memo from Steven Cover to Ginny Looney.
- 6. Memo from Ainsley Caldwell to Ibrahim Maslamani.
- 7. Copy of Mr. Domengeaux's field notebook.
- 8. Copies of Mr. Domengeaux's daily report he logged in File Maker Pro.
- 9. Copies of daily reports with plat maps attached.



NOTICE OF FINAL ADVERSE ACTION						
EMPLOYEE NAME	EMPLOYEE#	DEPT.	BUREAU	DATE OF ISSUE		
Stanley Domengeaux	1884	Planning and Community	Buildings	August 4, 2006		
		Development				

Domengeaux	Development			
Date Proposed Adverse Nature of Emergency (when	e Action Issued: June 20, 2000 re applicable)	6		
Final Adverse Action	: 3 days suspension without pa	y Effective	e Date: August 7,8	3,9, 2006
department heads or ag city; and Any other con Sections 114-528 (b)(1 Office conducted an in	ated: Willful making of false stargencies or the willful making of faduct or action of such seriousnes 2) and (20) of the City of Atlanta vestigation and concluded in the exist, properties on which no tree the Ethics Office Investigative Relationships and the Ethics Office Investigative Relation	alse statements ss that disciplin a Civil Service report that you grow and addr	on an employment ary action is considered. The City of made entries into yesses for which no	lered warranted, Atlanta's Ethics your work log of request for service
2	onded: July 27, 2006 _ Did not re	espond		(6)
Oral Written	ee Response_ x None			,
Indicate Whether Mo	odified Yes_x NoX (check one)	·		
COMPLETING THE EN	IS FINAL ADVERSE ACTION TO 'CLOSED APPEAL FORM AND SU	BMITTINGILI	TLANTA CIVIL SEF O THE BUREAU OF	RVICE BOARD BY LABOR RELATIONS
Signature of Commiss	ioner	Date _		
Employee Signature	This signature indicates receipt of	only, not agreen	Date of Receinent with action tak	
Date Mailed (Where applicable, atta	ach receipt)			
THIS NOTICE MUS RESPONSE	T BE GIVEN TO EMPLOYE	E WITHIN TH	IREE (3) DAYS O	F EMPLOYEE
yesi meranda / j	ika (1. 1811 - John Wille Jawa ya 1811	MILLON LOS YOUR	us Marine r	ger, " or